Implicit Bias and its Impact on Health

Amy L. Lee, MD, FAAFP
Tufts University School of Medicine
Department of Family Medicine
March 22, 2018
Objectives

- To explore how implicit bias fits into the larger picture of prejudice and bias
- To review the data demonstrating the impact of implicit bias on health
- To examine strategies to mitigate and reduce implicit bias
Disclosures

♦ None
Health Disparities

- 1990s: Hundreds of research studies are published documenting health disparities among various populations in the U.S.
- 1999: Congress asks the Institute of Medicine to assess the extent of racial and ethnic disparities in healthcare
- 2002: The IOM publishes its report: *Unequal Treatment – Confronting Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Healthcare*
Causes of Health Disparities

♦ Societal Factors
♦ Health Care System Factors
♦ Healthcare Organization Factors
♦ Clinician and Healthcare Team Factors
♦ Patient Factors
Explicit Bias vs. Implicit Bias

- Explicit Bias: the conscious attitudes and beliefs we have about a person or group

- Implicit Bias: attitudes or stereotypes that affect our understanding, decisions and actions in an unconscious manner
  - Activated involuntarily, without awareness
  - Positive or negative
  - Do not always align with our explicit beliefs
  - Have real-world effects on behavior
  - Develop over a lifetime, and are changeable
Studies Looking at Bias in Health
Issue of Respect in Healthcare

- Report of being treated with disrespect by healthcare provider due to race/ethnicity
  - White 9%
  - Black 14%
  - Hispanic 19%
  - Asian 20%

- Increased report of disrespect associated with:
  - Less follow through on medical advice
  - Less future care from any healthcare provider
  - Worse health outcomes
The Effect of Race and Sex on Physicians' Recommendations for Cardiac Catheterization
Implicit Bias among Physicians and its Prediction of Thrombolysis Decisions for Black and White Patients

- Green et al, Journal of General Internal Medicine, June 2007
Implicit Association Tests
Clinicians’ Implicit Ethnic/Racial Bias and Perceptions of Care Among Black and Latino Patients

Irene V. Blair, PhD, John F. Steiner, MD, MPH,
Diane L. Fairclough, DrPH, Rebecca Hanratty, MD, David W. Price,
MD, Holen K. Hirsh, PhD, Leslie A. Wright, MA, Michael Bronsert,
PhD, Elhum Karimkhani, MPH, David J. Magid, MD, and
Edward P. Havranek, MD
The Associations of Clinicians’ Implicit Attitudes About Race With Medical Visit Communication and Patient Ratings of Interpersonal Care

Lisa A. Cooper, MD, MPH, Debra L. Roter, DrPH, Kathryn A. Carson, ScM, Mary Catherine Beach, MD, MPH, Janice A. Sobier, PhD, MSW, Anthony G. Greenwald, PhD, and Thomas S. Inui, MD
Implicit Racial/Ethnic Bias Among Health Care Professionals and Its Influence on Health Care Outcomes: A Systematic Review

William J. Hall, PhD, Minni V. Chapman, PhD, Kent M. Lee, MS, Yessenia M. Merino, MPH, Talnayah W. Thomas, MPH, B. Keith Payne, PhD, Eugenia Eng, DrPH, Steven H. Day, MCP, and Tamara Corne-Brooksley, MD
Weight Bias among Health Professionals Specializing in Obesity

Marlene B. Schwartz, Heather O'Neal Chambliss, Kelly D. Brownell, Steven N. Blair, Charles Billington

First published: September 2003  Full publication history
We even have implicit bias about ourselves that affect outcomes
How can we reduce implicit bias?
Awareness: Understanding of and concern about the data demonstrating the reality of Implicit Bias and its negative impact (making the unconscious conscious)

Action: The desire and drive to work on a personal, organizational, and societal level to affect change
How to reduce implicit bias

Journal of General Internal Medicine
June 2007, Volume 22, Issue 6, pp 882–887 | Cite as

Reducing Racial Bias Among Health Care Providers: Lessons from Social-Cognitive Psychology

Authors

Diana Burgess , Michelle van Ryn, John Dovidio, Somnath Saha
How to reduce implicit bias

Journal of Experimental Social Psychology

Volume 48, Issue 6, November 2012, Pages 1267-1278

Long-term reduction in implicit race bias: A prejudice
habit-breaking intervention

Patricia G. Devine, Patrick S. Forscher, Anthony J. Austin, William T.L. Cox
The use of Analytics to identify potential unconscious bias in physician-patient encounter

Thursday, March 14, 2013: 10:30 AM - 12:30 PM, OAK; OCC 201

New Science of Unconscious Bias—In the past, human bias was regarded as conscious and intentional. Today, however, new science shows the role of unconscious, automatic judgments that shape interactions in medicine.
Implicit Bias Interventions

- Awareness of implicit bias and when it is most likely to be activated
  - Times of increased uncertainty
- Motivation to reduce implicit bias to align attitudes and behaviors with explicit personal and professional beliefs
- Conscious replacement of stereotyped thinking and categorization
  - MTV/Kirwan Institute Bias Cleanse
Counter-stereotyping: President
Scientist
Stay at home parent
Governor
Implicit Bias Interventions

- Awareness of stereotypes, motivation to change, conscious replacement of stereotyped thinking
- Individuation
  - Focus on the unique qualities of individuals, rather than categorizing
Individuation

HOW HOSTS CAN CULTIVATE UNBIASED HOSPITALITY
Implicit Bias Interventions

- Awareness of stereotypes, motivation to change, conscious replacement of stereotyped thinking
- Individuation
  - Focus on the unique qualities of individuals
- Perspective Taking
Reducing racial disparities in pain treatment: The role of empathy and perspective-taking

Brian B. Drwecki, Colleen F. Moore, Sandra E. Ward, Kenneth M. Prkachin
Perspective Taking: Video
Patient Centered Care with Cultural Humility

- Patient care is seen as a dynamic ongoing process whereby physicians might empathize with the lived experience of the patient’s illness, and try to understand the illness as the patient understands, feels, perceives, and responds to it.
  – Arthur Kleinman
Teaching Perspective Taking

- Teaching cross-cultural communication skills to medical students
- Specific focus on eliciting the patient’s perspective (PACT questions)
  - Problem: What do you think is causing this problem?
  - Affect: How is this affecting your life?
  - Concern: What concerns you the most?
  - Treatment: Do you think this treatment will help you?
Implicit Bias Interventions

- Awareness of stereotypes, motivation to change, conscious replacement of stereotyped thinking
- Individuation
  - Focus on the unique qualities of individuals
- Perspective Taking
- Big Data
- Working for Social Justice
Discussion

☆ amy.lee@tufts.edu
Bibliography page 1


♦ Shulman et al. The Effect of Race and Sex on Physicians’ Recommendations for Cardiac Catheterization. NEJM, Feb 1999


♦ Cooper et al. The associations of clinicians’ implicit attitudes about race with medical visit communication and patient ratings of interpersonal care. Am J Public Health, May 2012
Bibliography page 2

Resource Guide

♦ Project Implicit website and their book “Blind Spot”
  www.projectimplicit.com
♦ The Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity
  kirwaninstitute.osu.edu
♦ APHA webinar series on racism and health
  https://www.apha.org/events-and-meetings/webinars/racism-and-health
♦ MTV’s Look Different campaign
  www.lookdifferent.org
  www.lookdifferent.org/what-can-i-do/bias-cleanse